

30 October 2012

#### **Executive Summary**

The UN Human Rights Council's Universal Periodic Review (UPR) mechanism is meant to scrutinize the human rights records of all 193 UN member states once every four years. According to the Council's Institution Building Package, UPR's objectives are to achieve "the improvement of the human rights situation on the ground" in the country under review, and "the fulfilment of the State's human rights obligations and commitments." Reviews are to be conducted in an "objective," "non-selective" and "non-politicized" manner.

However, the last time Pakistan was reviewed, it was given a free pass. The countries conducting the 2008 reviews below were fully aware that Pakistan was failing to meet the minimal standards of a free democracy. For example, according to the UN's NGO compilation report of that year, Pakistan was found to be violating the right to life and liberty, the right to a free and fair trial, freedom of movement, freedom of speech, freedom of peaceful assembly and association, women's rights, children's rights, and the right to equality before the law. Yet out of the 36 countries who took the floor, no less than 20 heaped praise on Pakistan. They misused the process in order to legitimize Pakistan's human rights abuses, instead of holding its government to account.

#### For example:

- Cuba praised Pakistan for "advancing the legal and social status of women" and for "the steps taken to promote and protect human rights."
- Iran praised Pakistan for its "valuable efforts to promote and protect human rights."
- Jordan praised Pakistan for "working towards democracy and human rights," and for endeavoring to "advance the causes of men and women and their economic, social, and cultural rights as well as their political rights."

UN Watch calls on the countries speaking today to challenge Pakistan on specific areas of concern, and to directly criticize specific government policies and actions that violate human rights. For the methodology used in this report, see Mutual Praise Society.



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
AUSTRALIA	Free	JUSCANZ, WEOG	"[We are] pleased that political freedoms in Pakistan have improved significantly over the past year [We] encourage Pakistan to follow through by implementing the commitment and obligations within these [human rights] treaties Can Pakistan advise if it will also move to ratify the two Optional Protocols on the Convention on the Rights of the Child?"	Praises Pakistan, but also encourages it to implement human rights treaties and sign protocols on children's rights.	2
AZERBAIJAN	Not Free	EE, OIC	"Pakistan continues its efforts to protect human rights in accordance with international law The Government of Pakistan is making enormous strides in reducing poverty in the country which is a legacy of the colonial past We are pleased to see the tangible progress that Pakistan has made in ensuring women's rights."	Negative  Strongly praises Pakistan instead of holding it accountable for ongoing violations.	-9
BAHRAIN	Partly Free	Arab League, NAM, OIC	"Pakistan has been working tirelessly to consolidate human rights The government has adopted the national program for maternal and infant health My delegation highly appreciates the steps taken by Pakistan in the field of education Could the delegation of Pakistan shed light on the efforts being made by the new government to confirm and enhance freedom of information and the media?"	Negative  Strongly praises Pakistan on health, education, and human rights in general instead of holding it accountable for ongoing violations.  Poses question that is congratulatory rather than an actual challenge.	-8



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
BANGLADESH	Partly Free	Asian Group, NAM, OIC	"Human rights are best protected in an environment of plurality, where good governance and the rule of law are well sorted. Media is free We are happy to note that Pakistan has made considerable progress in all these areas One of the important indicators of a country's social progression is the status of women in society. Pakistan has attained enviable success in improving the status of women My delegation would like to know what measures have been adopted to modernize the education system in Madrassas."	Negative  Strongly praises Pakistan, including on women's rights that are in fact significantly violated.  Question on Madrassas not posed as a clear challenge.	-9
BRAZIL	Free	G77, GRULAC	"The Brazilian Government praises Pakistan for the positive measures and its efforts to face human rights challenges As recommendation, Brazil wished to propose to the Government of Pakistan to consider acceding to the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances,to consider establishing a national policy of protection of human rights defenders."	Praises Pakistan, but follows with specific recommendations on signing and ratifying human rights treaties, as well as a generic challenge on the protection of human rights defenders.	2



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
CANADA	Free	JUSCANZ, WEOG	"Gender discrimination and violence against	Positive	8
			women remain a problem. Canada recommends		
			the adoption of measures to ensure that victims	Strongly challenges Pakistan on	
			have access to protection and redress, that	discrimination and violence	
			perpetrators are prosecuted and punished and that	against women, the	
			gender sensitivity training be provided to relevant	criminalization of consensual	
			officials. Canada recommends repealing	sexual conduct, and	
			provisions of the Hudood Ordinances that	discrimination against religious	
			criminalize non-marital consensual sex and fail to	minorities.	
			recognize marital rape The second Amendment		
			to the Pakistani Constitution outlaws the Ahmadi	Makes specific	
			religion and the Penal Code allows for the	recommendations.	
			imprisonment of members of the Quadiani, Lhaori		
			and Ahmadi religions for preaching their faith."		
CHILE	Free	GRULAC	"We appreciate the efforts made by the	Positive	3
			government of Pakistan in the field of gender		
			We note the act adopted in 2004 which	Distinguishes between	
			criminalizes honor killings. We feel that it is	Pakistan's law against honor	
			fundamental that this law be applied as well as the	killings and its actual	
			punishment of the acts which it violates. We	implementation.	
			therefore wonder what is being done by the		
			government of Pakistan to ensure freedom of	Cautiously challenges Pakistan	
			worship and the integrity of the religious	and makes specific	
			communities."	recommendation.	



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
CHINA	Not Free	Asian group, G77	"We would like to congratulate wholeheartedly Pakistan for its numerous achievements in	Negative	- 8
			promoting economic growth, creating employment, eliminating illiteracy and providing health service We have taken note of the great attention paid by Pakistan in fulfilling its international obligations and its many legislative and administrative measures in the promotion and protection of human rights of women, children, and handicapped persons We would like to know how they protect the rights of minorities."	Strongly praises Pakistan instead of holding it accountable for ongoing violations. Praise extends to women's rights for which Pakistan deserves censure.  Generic question on rights of minorities not posed as clear challenge.	
CUBA	Not Free	GRULAC, NAM	"The heavy burden of centuries of colonialism, the arbitrary division of territory, terrorism and poverty have been only some of the dramatic problems that this noble people have had to struggle against Commendable effort has been made, for example, in the field of advancing the legal and social status of women In general, Cuba commends Pakistan on the steps taken to promote and protect human rights. We'd like to ask a question, lastly, concerning Pakistan's success in reducing child labor in a number of industries in the country."	Negative  Strongly praises Pakistan, including its progress on women's rights and reducing child labor despite the persistence of grave violations in these fields.  Blames Western states and other external factors for Pakistan's human rights challenges.	- 10



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
EGYPT	Not Free	African Group, Arab League, AU, G77, NAM, OIC	"We are indeed impressed with the significant progress Pakistan has achieved in the field of democracy and human rightseven when facing the most difficult challenges, such as terrorism  We encourage Pakistan to establish an independent national human rights institution Pakistan has achieved considerable progress in its efforts to eliminate child labor. We would appreciate if the delegation could shed light on the challenges that may still be persisting in this regard The promotion of blasphemy and adultery are obviously not parts of human rights protection and are hence not recommended."	Negative  Strongly praises Pakistan's "progress" on democracy, human rights, and the rule of law instead of holding it accountable for failures in these areas.  Praises Pakistan's "progress" on reducing child labor instead of noting that this remains a grave problem. Requests only that Pakistan itself identify challenges on this issue.  Comment on adultery appears to be a retort to Canada's question on Pakistan's criminalization of consensual sexual activities.	- 8
FRANCE	Free	EU, WEOG	"[On] freedom of religion and conviction, like other delegations, we wonder whether Pakistan envisages further amendments to the Blasphemy Act. [On] administration of justice, we would like to know what steps are being taken to ensure the independence of the judiciary and to foster access for all to justice."	Positive  Cautiously challenges Pakistan on freedoms and justice.	4



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
GERMANY	Free	EU, WEOG	"Concerns had been raised by CEDAW and CERD that discrimination against women still persists in a number of Pakistani laws Religious minorities face discrimination by the State and non-state actors. Which measures does the Pakistani Government take to effectively protect minorities? What measures is the government of Pakistan taking to protect the rights of prisoners? Some observers have expressed concern at Jum'a (Friday) Sermons in some Pakistani mosques inciting to hatred and violence against various groups inside and outside of Pakistan."	Positive  Strongly challenges Pakistan on issues pertaining to rights of women and minorities, prison conditions, and incitement to hatred and violence in religious sermons.	9
INDONESIA	Free	Asian Group, G77 and China, NAM, OIC	"We note that the government of Pakistan has also sought to further ensure the protection of vulnerable groups such as women, children and minorities We observe from [Pakistan's] report that the government has not only sought to assure the economic, social rights but also the civil and political rights of its citizens in a comprehensive and cohesive fashion We wish to seek further explanation on the steps taken by the government of Pakistan, as well as the best practices in dealing with [the terrorist] threat."	Negative  Praises Pakistan instead of holding it accountable for ongoing violations.  Poses question that is congratulatory rather than an actual challenge.	- 8
IRAN	Not Free	Asian Group, G77 and China, NAM, OIC	"The government of Pakistan has indeed made valuable efforts to promote and protect human rights We commend Pakistan for adoption of national laws in compliance with Islamic Shari'a and internationally recognized standards We would like also to recommend the esteemed government of Pakistan to increase its efforts and strengthen its policies in fighting against terrorism and extremism, any manifestation of violence, torture ill-treatment, economic exploitation and sexual abuse of women and children."	Negative  Praises Pakistan instead of holding it accountable for ongoing violations.  Makes recommendation that is congratulatory rather than an actual challenge.	- 8



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
ITALY	Free	EU, WEOG	"We would like to ask if Pakistanwould consider reducing the scope of offenses for which the death penalty may be imposed and establish a moratorium on executions with a view to abolish the death penalty We would like to recommend Pakistan to urgently adopt appropriate measures to effectively address the violations of children's rights especially child labor, prostitution, and trafficking, and to consider the increase of legal age of criminal responsibility We would like to recommend to Pakistanthe swift ratification of all core instruments of international human rights law."	Positive  Challenges Pakistan and makes recommendations on the death penalty, child abuse, and ratification of human rights treaties.	7
JAPAN	Free	Asian Group, JUSCANZ	"We would like to learn what measures you are planning to take in order to secure freedom of expression, freedom of association and the like  We appreciate the Government of Pakistan for launching various policy measures for the protection of the rights of women. In this regard, what action are you planning to take in order to implement such measures and further monitor them?"	Positive  Weakly and cautiously challenges Pakistan on several issues.	2



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
JORDAN	Partly Free	Arab League, Asian Group, G77,	"Pakistan has worked towards democracy and human rights. This history started off with the goal	Negative	- 10
		NAM, OIC	of building a moderate, modern democratic state,	Strongly praises Pakistan instead	
		, , ,	inspired by its Islamic traditions and its universal	of holding it accountable for	
			humanistic vision, and aimed at making a world	ongoing violations.	
			and society respecting the universal values of		
			human rights, including the freedom of expression,		
			the freedom of one's faith, and freedom of		
			association. In the context and framework of the		
			primacy of the justice system, Pakistan has		
			endeavored to advance the causes of men and		
			women and their economic, social, and cultural		
			rights as well as their political rights."		
MALAYSIA	Partly Free	Asian Group, G77,	"We are impressed with Pakistan's concrete legal	Negative	- 8
		NAM, OIC	and administrative measures to improve human		
			rights in many fields, as outlined in the	Praises Pakistan instead of	
			presentation and report. We recognize the	holding it accountable for	
			significant progress and achievements in the areas	ongoing violations.	
			of poverty eradication, as well as in such areas as		
			education, health, rights of children and women."		
MAURITIUS	Free	African Group,	"My delegation notes with interest that the report	Negative	- 8
		AU, G77, NAM	covers extensively the measures taken by Pakistan		
			to uphold family values The empowerment of	Strongly praises Pakistan for	
			women and the promotion of the rights of the child	promoting the rights of women	
		indeed constitute two major pillars of the human	and children instead of holding it		
			rights architecture. My delegation commends	accountable for shortcomings in	
			Pakistan for paying particular attention to the	these fields and other gross	
			promotion and protection of the rights of these two	human rights violations.	
			groups."		



COLINEDIA	COLINEDY ELL DATING A SELL LATIONG EVOEDDE EDOM CEATEMENT A COESCMENT COOD							
COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE			
MEXICO	Free	GRULAC	"We recommend that Pakistan accept the visits	Positive	5			
			requested by Special Procedures We also					
			recommend that Pakistan continue with its	Challenges Pakistan and makes				
			appropriate measures to eradicate discrimination	specific recommendations on				
			and violence against women, including domestic	several issues.				
			violence, and would appeal to it to strengthen					
			existing measures to thoroughly investigate crimes					
			related to violence against women We would					
			appeal to it to prevent and fight terrorism, and in					
			so doing to strictly adhere to international human					
			rights law, international refugee law and					
			international humanitarian law."					
NETHERLANDS	Free	EU, WEOG	"We recognize that Pakistan has made progress on	Positive	7			
			the situation of women within its society by the					
			introduction of the Women's Protection Act of	Challenges Pakistan on women				
			2006. We would like to know how Pakistan has	and minority rights, and on its				
			implemented and enforced this act in the light of	suspension of fundamental				
			recent trends within its society My delegation	freedoms.				
			would also like to recommend that Pakistan					
			restore, as soon as possible, all fundamental	Makes specific				
			freedomsthis implies reconfirming the	recommendations.				
			independence of the judiciary and cancelling all					
			remaining charges to human rights defenders					
			The situation of religious minorities is not					
			necessarily improving. We are especially					
			concerned by the way the Blasphemy Law is					
			invoked in practice."					



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
NICARAGUA	Partly Free	GRULAC, NAM	"Particularly is commendable the efforts to	Mixed	-1
			continue a process of political transition towards	D : D1:4 ;	
			full democracy and the significant progress in the	Praises Pakistan's progress	
			field of economic, social, and cultural rights We	instead of holding it accountable	
			would encourage, therefore, to continue to	for ongoing violations.	
			endeavor to strengthen its system for the		
			promotion and protection of all human rights,	Makes generic recommendation	
			particularly those of women."	on women's rights.	
NIGERIA	Partly Free	African Group,	"The effort of the Pakistani government through	Negative	- 6
		G77, NAM, OIC	affirmative action, to empower womenis quite		
			encouraging We recognize the difficulties faced	Praises Pakistan instead of	
			by Pakistan, namely serious economic challenges,	holding it accountable for	
			catastrophic drought conditions hampering the	ongoing violations.	
			economy, the armed conflict in some regions, the		
			high number of refugees, as well as the high	Pits blame for challenges on	
			population growth rate. We therefore encourage	external factors rather than	
			Pakistan to continue to take the desired steps to	government policies.	
			address the attendant challenges."		
PHILIPPINES	Partly Free	Asian Group, G77,	"We are glad to note that the government of	Negative	-7
		NAM	Pakistan has made steady progress in the	8	
			promotion and protection of civil and political	Praises Pakistan's progress	
			rights as well as economic, social, and cultural	instead of holding it accountable	
			rights of its people We also encourage Pakistan	for ongoing violations.	
			to continue to give utmost attention to combating		
			violence against women and promoting the rights		
			and well-being of children."		



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
QATAR	Not Free	Arab League,	"Human rights in the Republic of Pakistan are	Negative	- 8
		Asian Group, G77,	guaranteed politically and judicially. The		
		NAM, OIC	constitution guarantees equality and fair justice for	Praises Pakistan's laws instead	
			all The Pakistani legislation contains an	of noting shortcomings in	
			abundance of laws and ordinances which give	implementation.	
			force to the various provisions of international		
			conventions which Pakistan has adhered to.	Praises Pakistan on its justice	
			Furthermore, Pakistan has granted special	system instead of challenging it	
			importance to the protection of minorities,	on the lack of full judicial	
			disabled persons, women and children The	independence.	
			government of Pakistan acknowledges that tribal		
			and traditional mentalities are an obstacle in front	Only raises challenge that was	
			of the enhancement of women and full enjoyment	identified by Pakistan itself in its	
			of rights. What are the strategies and policies it	national report.	
			intends to adopt?"		
RUSSIA	Not Free	EE, OIC	"As stated in the national report, in Pakistan, there	Positive	4
		(Observer)	are still problems with effective promotion of the		
			full range of the rights of children We would	Challenges Pakistan on use of	
			like to know how the provisions of this law	corporal punishment in schools.	
			[against corporal punishment] will fit with the		
			criminal code which permits the use of corporal	Generically and weakly	
			punishment as a disciplinary method in schools.	challenges Pakistan on its	
			Finally, the CERD some time ago suggested to	treatment of ethnic and linguistic	
			Pakistan to provide to ethnic and linguistic groups	minorities.	
			the same status as enjoyed by religious minorities.		
			We would be grateful to the delegation for		
			information on the steps taken by the government		
			in this field."		



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
SAUDI ARABIA	Not Free	Arab League, Asian Group, G77, NAM, OIC	"Our congratulations, or rather the congratulations from these two committees [CEDAW and CRC], show our recognition of the efforts made by Pakistan in the field of human rights Pakistan is one of the first countries to be confronted by terrorism and the efforts in that respect should be recognized My question is: Pakistan has received a number of refugees over the past decades. But we learn that a decision has been taken to close camps and repatriate the inhabitants. Might not this be opposed to the principle of voluntary return by refugees and prisoners?"	Praises Pakistan instead of holding it accountable for ongoing violations.  Refers to UN committees to praise Pakistan while failing to underline negative aspects raised by these bodies.  Addresses one specific issue of	- 6
SENEGAL	Free	African Group, AU, G77, NAM, OIC	"We learned there that economic, social, and cultural rights occupy a significant place in Pakistan's development strategy. I noted, in particular, the considerable efforts being made by the Pakistani government to improve the status of women, children, and the disabled, as well as progress made in key sectors of education and health I wonder whether Pakistan envisages ratifying the Convention on the Protection of	concern.  Negative  Strongly praises Pakistan's social and economic policies, only citing Pakistan's national report.  Weakly challenges Pakistan on its failure to ratify a treaty on	- 7
SLOVENIA	Free	EE, EU	Migrant Workers."  "We are however concerned that no sufficient measures were adopted to ensure effective implementation of these new laws [on women's rights]. Neither the definition of discriminations nor the provisions on equality between men and women in the Constitution and other legislation are in line with the convention."	migrant workers.  Positive  Notes discrepancies between Pakistan's laws and their actual implementation.  Challenges Pakistan on women's rights.	5



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
SOUTH AFRICA	Free	African Group, AU, G77, NAM	"The government of Pakistan has acknowledged the existence of deep-rooted tribal and traditional mindsets as constraints in women's empowerment. What strategies or programs are or will be put in place to overcome this challenge? Illiteracy is identified as a major challenge in Pakistan. What specific measures does the government intend to take in this regards particularly to ensure that the girl-child accesses education at all levels? We wish to recommend that the government of Pakistan enhance its efforts in the provision of adequate housing and address the identified backlog in this regard as identified in the country's report."	Positive  Cites shortcomings that Pakistan acknowledged in its national report.	3
SOUTH KOREA	Free	Asian group, JUSCANZ	"Pakistan has carried out a number of legal reforms in order to eliminate discrimination against women But CEDAW expressed the concern that no sufficient measures were adopted in order to ensure their effective implementation Since more than 250,000 people were to be rendered homeless after a process of eviction and destruction of homes, we were wondering if the delegation could kindly update us on the situation of this population We would like to join with others in recommending that the government would consider signing the convention [on refugees]."	Positive  Cautiously challenges Pakistan on discrimination against women and a specific incident in which Pakistan evicted citizens from their homes.  Makes specific recommendation for Pakistan to sign a treaty on refugees.	5



F			weu i akistan in the 2000 Of K		I
COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
SUDAN	Not Free	African Group, AU, G77, NAM, OIC	"The constitution [of Pakistan] entrenches fundamental rights, thereby guaranteeing their development and progress The contribution of	Negative Strongly praises Pakistan instead	-10
			Pakistan in the multilateral effort to promote and protect human rights merits applaud. We recommend that Pakistan shares its experience in	of holding it accountable for ongoing violations.	
			poverty reduction."	Makes congratulatory recommendation.	
SWITZERLAND	Free	JUSCANZ, WEOG	"Switzerland recommends to Pakistan to do everything possible to prevent early marriages and	Positive	7
			to recognize in its legislation rape within marriage. Switzerland recognizes that Pakistan has a draft law on the protection of children and encourages it	Challenges Pakistan on several specific issues.	
			to implement it rapidly The death penalty is still broadly applied in Pakistan. Switzerlandwould wish Pakistan to move towards abolishing the death penalty. Switzerland recalls that the rules for fair trial are fundamental, and recommends to Pakistan to respect these as diligently as possible."	Makes specific recommendation.	
SYRIA	Not Free	Arab League, Asian Group, OIC	"Pakistan has an ideal constitution and legal system scarcely to find its counterpart in the developing world Pakistan's achievements in the field of human rights are quite conspicuous in,	Negative Strongly praises Pakistan.	- 8
			inter alia, the political empowerment of women, including the criminalizing of what is called "honor killings," social insurance system, housing and the provision of quality education I would	Fails to distinguish between laws and their actual implementation, e.g., regarding honor killings.	
			like to have more details about some media reports that Pakistan is considering the deportation or repatriation of some Afghani refugees."	Weakly challenges Pakistan on its treatment of Afghan refugees.	



COUNTRY	FH RATING	AFFILIATIONS	EXCERPT FROM STATEMENT	ASSESSMENT	SCORE
UNITED KINGDOM	Free	EU, WEOG	"We would welcome an update on the bill to establish a national commission on human rightsand would like to recommend such a commission be established in accordance with the Paris Principles What steps will be taken to monitor and investigate human rights violations perpetrated by the security forces, including illegal and arbitrary arrests, enforced disappearance, extrajudicial killings? We recommenda repeal of additional aspects of the Hudood and Zina Ordinances to ensure full compatibility with the CEDAW."	Positive  Challenges Pakistan on several issues and makes specific recommendations.	6
ZIMBABWE	Not Free	African group, AU, G77, NAM	"Pakistan is to be applauded for the tremendous strides that it has made in such a short space of time in its transition towards full democracy, despite the many challenges that it faces, chief of which is the menace of terrorism. Parallel to these civil and political reforms, the Pakistani government has embraced a sound economic policy."	Negative Strongly praises Pakistan instead of holding it accountable for ongoing violations.	- 10